

October 2, 2024

H. Thomas Byron III, Secretary
Committee on Rules of Practice and Procedure
Administrative Office of the United States Courts
One Columbus Circle, NE, Room 7-300
Washington, D.C. 20544

Re: Procedural Consistency for the Disclosure of Third-Party Litigation Funding

Dear Mr. Byron:

Our companies, actively engaged in the federal civil justice system as both plaintiffs and defendants, are concerned about the procedural inconsistencies and deficiencies related to disclosure of third-party litigation funding (“TPLF”). As federal judges have become increasingly aware of the reasons why courts and parties need to know about TPLF, they are employing varied and often insufficient means of inquiry. We respectfully ask the Advisory Committee on Civil Rules (“Advisory Committee”) to amend the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (“FRCP”) to provide a uniform and efficient procedure for disclosure of TPLF agreements in civil cases.

I. IT IS UNFAIR TO DENY PARTIES INFORMATION ABOUT WHO CONTROLS THE LITIGATION

We need TPLF disclosure to understand who has control of the case. We know from experience that when TPLF is present in our cases, it fundamentally alters the dynamics and has a major impact on whether the dispute can be resolved through settlement. We cannot make informed decisions without knowing the stakeholders who control the litigation—and we cannot understand the control features of a TPLF agreement without reading the agreement. Without this information, the settlement process often unravels when the nominal plaintiff or its counsel needs to obtain approval from undisclosed non-party funders or uses the non-party as an excuse to retract a commitment to settle. (This is the very reason why courts typically require us to appear with authority and our insurance representatives in settlement conferences and mediations.)

II. DISCLOSURE OF TPLF AGREEMENTS IS ESSENTIAL TO THE FUNCTION OF KEY FRCP AND WITNESS SAFEGUARDS

When defendants are kept in the dark about TPLF agreements, they are prevented from utilizing several key FRCP provisions as intended. For example:

- FRCP 26(b)(1) describes “the resources of the parties” as a factor relevant to whether a particular discovery request is proportional to the needs of the case. When courts do not allow us to know if the named parties are funded by TPLF investors, we cannot argue, and the court cannot weigh, how the resources of the parties should factor into decisions about the scope of discovery. This proportionality factor, which was added to the FRCP

in 2015, is meaningless when TPLF agreements providing resources to a party are kept secret.

- Similarly, if we are not allowed to understand the control features and resource provisions of TPLF agreements, we are significantly constrained in making meaningful arguments about allocating costs pursuant to FRCP 26(c)(1)(B) and sanctions under FRCP 37.
- Without TPLF disclosure, we have no ability to expose to the court and jury when witnesses have conflicts of interest caused by their financial relationship with non-party funders, including direct payments as well as the potential that they will financially benefit from the outcome of the case.
- When we do not know who stands to benefit directly from the judgment or settlement in a case, we do not have the protection of FRCP 17(a)(1), which requires that “[a]n action must be prosecuted in the name of the real party in interest.”

III. INADEQUATE PRACTICES SUCH AS *EX PARTE* CONVERSATIONS SHOULD NOT BE THE STANDARD MEANS OF INQUIRY ABOUT TPLF

Some judges ask whether parties are using TPLF during initial scheduling conferences. Other judges engage in *ex parte* discussions with plaintiffs’ counsel in chambers, sometimes reviewing portions of a TPLF agreement *in camera*. Still others have issued written orders requiring counsel to answer questions in writing, *ex parte*, about TPLF agreements but not reviewing the underlying TPLF agreements. Problematically, few judges follow up during the course of litigation to ask whether new TPLF deals have been struck since their initial questions or give any indication that disclosure is an ongoing obligation. And, of course, some judges continue to resist making any sort of inquiry whatsoever. This variety of approaches and inconsistent practices is creating a fragmented and incoherent procedural landscape in the federal courts.

The FRCP should establish a uniform and straightforward procedure for initial TPLF disclosure and continuing notification of changes so courts do not have to devise their own schemes and parties do not have to guess what will be required or allowed from court to court and case to case. A rule is particularly needed to supersede the misplaced reliance on *ex parte* conversations; *ex parte* communications are strongly disfavored by the Code of Conduct for U.S. Judges (Canon 3(A)(4)) because they are both ineffective in educating courts and highly unfair to the parties who are excluded. FRCP guidance is necessary to supplant practices by which courts are entertaining potential factual and legal disagreements – and in effect ruling on them – without the benefit of the other parties’ views and without informing the parties that the court is reaching conclusions on legal questions.

IV. DEFENDANTS NEED TPLF DISCLOSURE FOR THE SAME REASONS THE FRCP PROVIDE PLAINTIFFS WITH OUR INSURANCE AGREEMENTS

Our companies need to know about TPLF when we are sued for the same reasons that the Advisory Committee promulgated FRCP 26(a)(1)(A)(iv) to require defendants to disclose our insurance agreements. The Advisory Committee explained in 1970 that disclosure of insurance contracts “will enable counsel for both sides to make the same realistic appraisal of the case, so that settlement and litigation strategy are based on knowledge and not speculation.” The Advisory Committee’s reasoning applies equally to TPLF agreements because we need to be

aware of key factors to make realistic and knowing assessments of the case and to develop appropriate litigation strategies. Without this information, we are at a major disadvantage in determining whether there are non-parties with a direct interest in, and influence or control over, the outcome of the case and in understanding whether the case can be resolved through settlement.

CONCLUSION

We urge the Advisory Committee to propose a straightforward, uniform rule for TPLF disclosure to remedy the current imbalanced and inconsistent litigation dynamic that is prejudicial and frustrates civil justice. The FRCP should require disclosure of TPLF agreements that provide non-parties a direct interest in the outcome of the case. Absent such a rule, the continued uncertainty and court-endorsed secrecy of non-party funding in our cases will further unfairly skew federal civil litigation.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

James L. Parnell
President & CEO
Alfa Insurance

Kelly Doherty-Schaffner
Executive Vice President
Allied World Insurance Company

Christine DeBiase
Executive Vice President, Chief Legal Officer and General Counsel
The Allstate Corporation

Brad Dantic
Chief Legal Officer
ALPS Corporation

Geoffrey J. Michael
Senior Vice President & Associate General Counsel
Altria Client Services, LLC

Andrew DeVore
Vice President & Associate General Counsel
Amazon.com, Inc.

Steve Donnelly
Chief Claims Officer
Amerisure Insurance Company

Jennifer A. Morrison
Senior Vice President and General Counsel
Amica Mutual Insurance Company

John Bruno
EVP, General Counsel, Secretary and Human Resources
The Auto Club Group

Bart A. Whitley
Senior Vice President
Head Global Litigation
Bayer U.S.

Michelle T. Quinn, Esq.
EVP and General Counsel
Becton Dickinson and Company

Marie-Helene Cantin
Senior Legal Counsel
Bombardier Recreational Products Inc.

Melanie Irvin
VP, Head of Legal & Government Affairs
Branch Insurance Exchange

Robert F. Glass, CPCU, ARM, MBA
President and CEO
Brethren Mutual Insurance Company

Donald C. Le Gower
Vice President, Head of Litigation and Government Investigations
Bristol Myers Squibb

Joseph Wayland
General Counsel
Chubb

Thomas C. Hogan, Esq.
Executive Vice President
Chief Legal Officer
The Cincinnati Insurance Company

Sarita Venkat
VP & Deputy General Counsel, Litigation & Competition
Cisco

Susan A. Stone
Executive Vice President and General Counsel
CNA

Erin Bagley
EVP, Chief Legal Officer & Corporate Secretary
Coaction Specialty Insurance Group

Lisa M. Floro
VP, General Counsel
Global Litigation
Group Legal, IP & Business Ethics
Coloplast Corp

Thomas J. Reid
Chief Legal Officer and Secretary
Comcast Corporation

Thomas Warnock, Sr.
Vice President and Deputy General Counsel, Head of Litigation
Corteva Agriscience

James M. Jacobs
Chief Executive Officer
COUNTRY Financial®

TJ England
Chief Legal Officer
C.R. England, Inc.

Curtis Ruwe
Vice President and General Counsel
Crete Carrier Corporation and Hunt Transportation, Inc.

David M. Toolan
Vice President & General Counsel
CRH Americas, Inc.

Lisa A. Stephenson
VP - General Counsel
CRST The Transportation Solution, Inc.

Michael P. McTigue
Chief Legal Officer
Crum & Forster

Nichole M. Tennyson
Chief Legal Officer
Daimler Truck North America, LLC

Rick J. Hecker, Esq.
Vice President, General Counsel
Donegal Mutual Insurance Company

Taras G. Szmagala
EVP & Chief Legal Officer
Eaton Corporation

Jill Jacobson
General Counsel
Electrolux North America, Inc.

Anat Hakim
Executive Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary
Eli Lilly and Company

Rich Appel
Senior Vice President and Senior Counsel
Endurance Assurance Corporation

James Nealon III
Senior Vice President, Law
Erie Insurance Group

Janice W. Beacham
SR Director, Risk Management
Estes Express Lines

Ricardo Anzaldua
EVP and General Counsel
Everest Insurance

Jeffrey A. Taylor
General Counsel and Secretary
Exxon Mobil Corporation

Daniel D. Pitcher
CEO
Farm Bureau Financial Services

Lisa Conley
SVP, General Counsel
FCCI Insurance Group

Cary Blancett
Senior Vice President, Litigation and Business Transactions
Federal Express Corporation

Nick Lower
President & CEO
Federated Mutual Insurance Company

Sarahannah McMurtry
EVP, General Counsel
First Acceptance Insurance Company

Rory Brecker
General Counsel
Flatiron Health, Inc.

Robert Brunelli
Staff Senior Vice President
Litigation Division Manager & Assistant General Counsel
FM

Doug Lampe
Counsel
Ford Motor Company

Winnie Swan
General Counsel
Foundation Medicine, Inc.

Fox Corporation

Andrew Knudsen
President & COO
Frankenmuth Insurance

Felicia V. Manno
Global Chief Counsel, Litigation & Investigations
GE HealthCare

Katherine Nolan-Stevaux, Ph.D., J.D.
Head, General Litigation Group
Genentech, Inc.

Grant Dixon
Executive Vice President, Chief Legal, Public Policy Officer & Corporate Secretary
General Motors Company

Alvina Hou
Associate General Counsel, Litigation and Investigations
Gilead Sciences, Inc.

Halimah DeLaine Prado
General Counsel
Google LLC

Brian Allen
VP, Chief Risk Officer
Grange Insurance Association

Aaron B. Latto
Senior Vice President
Great American Insurance Company

James Ford
Senior Vice President and Group General Counsel, Legal and Compliance
GSK LLC

Tony Corleto
Chief Legal Officer
HAI Group

Dennis Kerrigan
Executive Vice President and Chief Legal Officer
The Hanover Insurance Group

Don Hunt
Executive Vice President & General Counsel
The Hartford

Mary-Alice Barrett
Assistant Secretary
Hoffmann-La Roche Inc.

Dina Daskalakis
Executive Vice President & General Counsel
Hudson Insurance Group

Tom Vanderford
Associate General Counsel
Executive Director, Litigation
Hyundai Motor America

Intel Corporation

Erik Haas
Worldwide Vice President, Litigation
Johnson & Johnson

Jonathan R. Murphy
Managing Counsel
Kawasaki Motors Corp., U.S.A.

C. Thomas Evans, Jr.
Executive Vice President, Secretary and General Counsel
Kemper Corporation

Tracey Van Dillen
Head of Litigation & Employment Law
Kenvue

Brett Sant
Senior Vice President
Knight Swift Transportation Holdings, Inc.

Damon Hart
Executive Vice President, Chief Legal Officer & Secretary
Liberty Mutual Insurance

Robin Russo CPCU, ARM, ASLI
Executive Vice President
Markel

Ivan Fong
Executive Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary
Medtronic

Robert Ragan
Chief Financial Officer
Melton Truck Lines, Inc.

James Holston
Associate Vice President, Global Litigation
Merck & Co., Inc.

Scott Tucker
Vice President & Deputy General Counsel, Global Litigation
Meta Platforms, Inc.

Jonathan M. Palmer
General Counsel & Corporate Vice President
Microsoft Corporation

Roger S. Pecher
Director of Claims
Missouri Farm Bureau

Richard Alleyne
Chief Legal Officer for Munich Re US P&C Companies
Munich Re Services America, Inc.

Natalie T. Furniss
SVP, Corporate Operations & Litigation Legal
Office of Chief Legal Officer
Nationwide

Kate Ro
Senior Vice President & General Counsel
New Jersey Manufacturers Insurance Company

Chris Reed
Chief Risk Officer and General Counsel
Nonprofits Insurance Alliance

Robert Sikellis
Global Head of Litigation and Investigations
Novartis

Barak Ben-Arye
General Counsel
NovoCure Limited

Marc E. Fishman
VP, Deputy General Counsel - Head of Litigation North America
Novo Nordisk Inc.

Steven L. Patterson
President and CEO
Oregon Mutual Insurance Group

Gerard M. Devlin, Jr.
Vice President - IP, Investigations, Litigation & Employment Law
Organon & Co.

Doug Lankler
General Counsel and Executive Vice President
Pfizer Inc.

Robert Spadafora
General Counsel
Philips North America

Susan Street Whaley
Chief Legal Officer and Secretary
The Procter & Gamble Company

Eric Santoro
Head of Global Litigation and Investigations
Reckitt

Ginamarie Alvino
Vice President/Director
Riverstone Claims Management LLC

Whitney J. Johnson
Vice President, General Counsel & Secretary
Roche Diagnostics Corporation

Michael D. Lisi
Head of Legal
Roche Diagnostics Solutions

Samsung Electronics America, Inc.

Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd.

Susan A. (Sam) Manardo
Head, N.A. Litigation & Investigations
Legal, Ethics, Business Integrity & Global Security
Sanofi US

Thomas Jackson
Executive Vice President, Government and Regulatory Affairs, and General Counsel
Schneider National, Inc.

Marisa Trasatti
General Counsel
Sciton, Inc.

Daniel P. Ferris
Senior Vice President, Chief Legal Officer & Corporate Secretary
SECURA Insurance Companies

Michael H. Lanza
EVP & General Counsel
Selective Insurance Group, Inc.

Jeanne E. Walker
Associate General Counsel
Shell USA, Inc.

Brian Waller, JD
Vice President, Government Relations
Shelter Insurance Companies

Mary L. Garceau
Senior Vice President, Chief Legal Officer and Secretary
The Sherwin-Williams Company

Heather Friedl, Esq
Assistant General Counsel & Assistant Corporate Secretary
Society Insurance

Robert Shaughnessy, SCLA, AIC
Vice President of Claims
Southern Pioneer Property & Casualty Insurance Company

Edgar R. Ocampo
General Counsel & Senior Director of Risk Management
Stan Koch & Sons Trucking, Inc.

Keesha-Lu Mitra
Senior Vice President and General Counsel
State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company

Michael J. Jarrett
Vice President, Legal & Compliance
Texas Farm Bureau Insurance Companies

Lawrence J. La Sala
V.P. & Deputy General Counsel - Litigation
Textron Inc.

Elizabeth B. Gibson
Deputy General Counsel/Vice President
Toyota Motor North America, Inc.

Christine Kalla
EVP and General Counsel
Travelers

Scott Ewing
Executive Vice President and Chief Legal Officer
Trinity Industries, Inc.

John H. Fenner
Vice President/Corporate General Counsel
Turner Industries Group

John R. Lytle
Director of Products Litigation
U-Haul International, Inc.

Sarah E Madsen
SVP, Chief Legal Officer & Corporate Secretary
United Fire Group, Inc.

Jill Termini
Associate General Counsel - Litigation
United Parcel Service, Inc.

Vandana Venkatesh
Executive Vice President Public Policy & Chief Legal Officer
Verizon

Douglas Miner
General Counsel, North America
Viatris Inc.

Nathan Meisgeier
President and Chief Legal Officer
Werner Enterprises, Inc.

John Buckley, Esq., CPCU
Senior Vice President
Western National Insurance Company

Jennifer Souza
General Counsel
Westfield

Chad Phipps
Senior Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary
Zimmer Biomet

Deirdre Manna
SVP, Head of Government & Regulatory Relations
Zurich North America